

Appendix 1 b. Review of the Programme for the Endorsement of Forest Certification schemes (PEFC)

December 2010

This appendix contains the full results of the review of the PEFC scheme against the UK Government criteria.

Executive Summary

Date of Current Assessment: November 2010 (published December 2010)

Current Status

Meets requirements for legality

Meets requirements for sustainability

Source Documents

PEFC Council Technical Document, 5 October 2007

PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 1 PEFC Terms and Definitions, 27 October 2006

PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 2 Rules for Standard Setting, 27 October 2006

PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 3 Basis for Certification Schemes and their Implementation, 13 November 2009

PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 4 Chain of Custody of Forest Based Products – Requirements, 17 June 2005

PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 6 Certification and Accreditation Procedures, 5 October 2007

PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 7 Endorsement and Mutual Recognition of National Schemes and their Revision, 5 October 2007

PEFC International Standard PEFC ST 2001:2008 – PEFC Logo usage rules – requirements

PEFC Reference Document PEOLG Pan European Operational level Guidelines for SFM, June 1998

PEFC Council Guidelines GL2/2010. Minimum Requirements Checklist, 4 February 2010

PEFC Council Guidelines GL5/2006. Interpretation of the PEFC Council Requirements for Consensus in the Standard Setting Process, 26 October 2006.

PEFC Council Guidelines GL6/2006 PEFC Notification of certification bodies operating chain of custody certification in countries without a PEFC national governing body

PEFC Council Guidelines GL7/2007. Procedures for the Investigation and Resolution of Complaints and Appeals, 28 June 2007

PEFC Council Guidelines GL8/2008. Involvement of the Panel of Experts in the Endorsement of National Forest Certification Schemes, 30 April 2008.

PEFC Guide GD 1003:2009. PEFC Council technical documents development procedures - requirements. Issue 1. 2009-01-29.

MCPFE Pan European Criteria and Indicators for Sustainable Forest Management

MCPFE Pan European Operational Level Guidelines

ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests (ATO/ITTO PCI)

ITTO Guidelines on the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests (1992)

ITTO Guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical forests (1993)

ITTO Manual for the Application of Criteria and Indicators for Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests (1998)

ITTO Revised Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Management of Tropical Forests including Reporting Format (2005)

ITTO/IUCN Guidelines for the conservation and sustainable use of biodiversity in tropical timber production forests (2009)

SAVCOR-INDUFOR (2006) Compatibility of the ITTO Provisions of the Management of Natural and Planted Forests with the PEOLG. Final Report 1.2.

1. Forest Standards

1.1. Content of standards for legal compliance

Criteria	Findings	Score	L ¹	S
1.1.1 The standard requires that the forest owner/manager holds legal use rights to the forest	<p>Fully addressed.</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 3, Section 3.5 Other requirements for forest management criteria: "property rights and land tenure arrangements shall be clearly defined, documented and established for the relevant forest area. Likewise, legal, customary and traditional rights related to the forest land should be clarified, recognised and respected."</p> <p>PEOLG Criterion 6.1b: "Property rights and land tenure arrangements should be clearly defined, documented and established for the relevant forest area. Likewise, legal, customary and traditional rights related to the forest land should be clarified, recognised and respected."</p> <p>ITTO sub-indicator 4.1.1.1 "provisions of forest law on rights of use and ownership are known and respected."</p>	2	✓	
<p>1.1.2 The standard requires compliance from both the forest management organisation and any contractors with local and national legal requirements including those relevant to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Forest management • Environment • Labour and welfare • Health & safety • Other parties' tenure and use rights 	<p>Fully addressed.</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 3, section 3.2 states that "National laws, regulations, programs and policies shall be respected in forest management and certification. Certification schemes may not contradict legislation and any apparent violations of the legislation shall be taken into consideration in internal and external audits."</p> <p>Section 3.6: "The national certification criteria shall:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - require compliance with national legislation - be in compliance with the fundamental International labour Organisation (ILO) Conventions. If the requirements of the Conventions are incorporated into national legislation, which is the case when a country has ratified the Conventions, the certification criteria shall require compliance with the national legislation relevant to the core ILO conventions." 	2	✓	
1.1.3 The standard requires payment of all relevant royalties and taxes	<p>Partially addressed.</p> <p>The TP notes that the guidance to the CPET criterion</p>	1	✓	

¹ L: required to meet requirements for legal, S: required to meet requirements for sustainable variant

Criteria	Findings	Score	L ¹	S
	<p>states: "Where payment is clearly required by law, then an explicit requirement for legal compliance is sufficient for a score of 1."</p> <p>There is no specific reference to payment of royalties and taxes. PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 3 section 3.2 states that "National laws, regulations, programs and policies shall be respected in forest management and certification." Section 3.6 states that: "The national certification criteria shall:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - require compliance with national legislation." <p>The TP concludes that the PEFC's current requirements justify a score of 1.</p>			
1.1.4 The standard requires compliance with the requirements of CITES in signatory countries.	<p>Fully addressed.</p> <p>Technical Document Annex 3 section 3.4 Other international conventions:</p> <p>"Other international conventions relevant to forest management and ratified by country will be respected through the legislative framework. Such conventions include, amongst others, e.g. Convention on Biological Diversity, Kyoto Protocol and Carbon Sinks, Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora and Biosafety Protocol."</p> <p>"The requirements agreed upon in the conventions, even if they are not ratified by the country, will be respected in the certification criteria to the degree they are covered in PEOLG or other reference basis approved by the PEFC Council."</p> <p>In addition, PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 4 section 3.6.4 states "The organisation procuring raw material originating from threatened and endangered species classified by CITES shall follow all regulations defined by CITES and other international as well as national legislation."</p>	2	✓	

1.2. Content of standards for sustainable variant

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
1.2.1 Certification standards must be consistent with a widely accepted set of international principles and criteria defining sustainable or responsible forest management at the forest management unit level.	<p>Fully addressed.</p> <p>The PEFC system uses a number of sets of international principles and criteria as the reference basis for forest certification standards used by PEFC endorsed schemes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Pan-European Operational Level Guidelines; - ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable 	2		✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>Management of Natural Tropical Forests;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - ITTO Guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests; - ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests - ITTO/IUCN Guidelines for the Conservation and Sustainable Use of Biodiversity in Tropical Timber Production Forests <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 3 chapter 3.6 states that schemes must “be compatible and consistent with the current PEOLG or ATO /ITTO PCI (only for countries covered by ATO/ITTO PCI) or the relevant ITTO guidelines (only for ITTO producing member countries except those covered by ATO / ITTO PCI)”.</p> <p>PEFC Technical Document Annex 3 chapter 3.1.4 states that “The forest certification criteria for forest management of natural tropical forests shall be compatible with:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - ITTO guidelines on the sustainable management of tropical natural forests (1992) - ITTO/IUCN guidelines on the conservation and sustainable use of biodiversity in tropical timber production forests (2009).” <p>Provisions found in the ITTO/IUCN guidelines are required by PEFC only if the provisions are applicable to forest management units.</p> <p>PEFC Technical Document Annex 3 chapter 3.1.4 states that “For the purposes of the PEFC assessment and endorsement process, the provisions of the ITTO guidelines shall be interpreted as normative and obligatory.”</p> <p>In addition to the above requirements of the ITTO Guidelines for Natural Tropical Forests the certification criteria for natural tropical forests shall be compatible with PEOLG 2.1a, 2.2a, 3.2d, 6.1a, 6.1e, 6.2b.</p> <p>The forest certification criteria for the forest management of planted tropical forests shall be compatible with ITTO Guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests (1993). In addition to the requirements of the ITTO Guidelines for the Tropical</p>			

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>Planted Forests the certification criteria shall be compatible with PEOLG 2.2b, 4.2f, 4.2i and 6.1a.</p> <p>PEFC GL2/2010 PEFC Council Minimum Requirements Checklist is the reference document for assessments of certification schemes for endorsement: "These guidelines ... shall be met by national and sub-national schemes and standards applying for PEFC Council endorsement ..." (page 2).</p>			
1.2.2 The standard must be performance-based.	<p>Fully addressed.</p> <p>The TP notes that PEOLG and ITTO guidelines frequently use the word "should", which is not as strong as "shall". The following two statements from PEFC documents address the point:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - PEFC Council Technical Document section 4.2 states: "For the purposes of PEFC assessment and endorsement of national or sub-national forest certification schemes the term 'should' used in the PEOLG shall be interpreted as 'shall'." - PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 3, section 3.1.4. states: "For the purposes of the PEFC assessment and endorsement process, the provisions of the ITTO Guidelines shall be interpreted as normative and obligatory." <p>The PEOLG and other intergovernmental processes contain performance requirements.</p>	2		✓
1.2.3 The standard must ensure that harm to ecosystems is minimised. In order to do this the standard must include requirements for:	<p>Fully addressed</p> <p>Aspect a - fully addressed:</p> <p>PEOLG:</p> <p>There is no specific single requirement to assess the impacts of forest management, but it is addressed explicitly or implicitly throughout the PEOLG through Criterion 2.1c "Forest management plans or their equivalents should specify ways and means to minimise the risk of degradation of and damages to forest ecosystems".</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Section 3.1.7 Environmental impact assessment, Principle 20: "Forest management operations can have important positive or negative environmental consequences, both in the forest itself and outside (transboundary effects). These consequences should be assessed in advance of operations to ensure</p> <p>a. Appropriate assessment of impacts and planning to minimise impacts;</p> <p>b. Protection of soil, water and biodiversity;</p> <p>c. Controlled and appropriate use of chemicals and use of Integrated Pest Management wherever possible.</p> <p>d. Proper disposal of wastes to minimise any negative impacts.</p>	2		✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>overall sustainability.”</p> <p>ITTO guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Section 3 Feasibility Assessment, 3.1 Environmental considerations - the section on feasibility deals with the assessment of forest programmes including determining environmental impacts and effects to biodiversity and ecosystems.</p> <p>Recommended action 13: "Include comprehensive environmental impact assessment procedures in all pre-planting feasibility investigations. Promote the positive impacts of change while simultaneously minimizing any adverse impacts, so as to increase the overall benefits of the proposed planted forest to the community".</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Indicator 3.1.1 requires that "Available knowledge allows an ecological assessment and diagnosis of the forest ecosystems' and in Indicator 3.1.2 that 'Impact studies are carried out, in relation to the scale of harvesting, in accordance with the level and extent of scarcity of any resources of concern. These studies are incorporated into the forest management document."</p> <p>Aspect b - fully addressed:</p> <p>PEOLG:</p> <p>Requirements for protection of soil, water and biodiversity are covered in several places, but in particular in criteria 4 and 5. PEOLG Criterion 5 Maintenance and appropriate enhancement of protective functions in forest management (notably soil and water). PEOLG Criterion 4 Maintenance, conservation and appropriate enhancement of biological diversity in forest ecosystems.</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Partially covered by section 3.2 Harvesting, in particular Principle 24. Extraction frequently involves the use of heavy machinery and, therefore, precautions must be taken to avoid</p>			

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>damage.</p> <p>Possible action 21. A logging plan should be drawn up including:</p> <p>areas where logging is subject to special restrictions or forbidden (flora and fauna conservation and soil protection areas, buffer strips, sites of cultural interest);</p> <p>specifications for construction and restoration of skidding tracks, watercourse crossings and log landing (including drainage);</p> <p>Etc.</p> <p>ITTO guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Addressed by PEOLG criteria 2.2b, 4.2f, 4.2i.</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Criteria 3.3 (biodiversity) and 3.5 (water & soils) list numerous relevant indicator requirements to minimize operation impacts.</p> <p>ITTO/IUCN Guidelines for the Conservation and Sustainable Use of Biodiversity in Tropical Timber Production Forests:</p> <p>Principle 9 provides guidance on biodiversity considerations at FMU level.</p> <p>Aspect c - fully addressed:</p> <p>PEOLG:</p> <p>Criterion 2.2c: "The use of pesticides and herbicides should be minimised, taking into account appropriate silvicultural alternatives and other biological means."</p> <p>PEOLG Criterion 2.2d also states that "In case fertilisers are used they should be applied in a controlled manner and with due consideration to the environment.2</p> <p>PEOLG Criterion 2.2a requires that 2Forest management practices should make best use of natural structures and processes and use preventive biological measures wherever and as far as economically feasible to maintain and enhance the health and vitality of forests."</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests</p>			

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>Principle 28: "Chemicals, such as the ones used in the silvicultural treatment, constitute risks both in terms of personnel safety and environmental pollution"</p> <p>Possible action 25 "Instructions for handling and storage of chemicals and waste oil should be provided and enforced. Special restrictions are to apply near water courses and other sensitive areas".</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests</p> <p>Section 4.2.5 considers the use of fertilisers on planted forest and recommends a series of actions to reduce the use of chemical fertilisers.</p> <p>Section 4.2.7 considers pest and disease management and recommends actions to ensure integrated pest management.</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Sub-indicator 3.5.2.4 states, that "Management systems promote the development and adoption of environmentally friendly, non-chemical methods of pest management and strive to avoid the use of chemical pesticides. World Health Organization Type 1A and 1B and chlorinated hydrocarbon pesticides, pesticides that are persistent, toxic or whose derivatives remain biologically active and accumulate in the food chain beyond their intended use, and any pesticides banned by international agreement, are prohibited. If chemicals are used, proper equipment and training is provided to minimize health and environmental risks.' Sub-indicator 3.3.4.3 requires 'The use of biological control agents is documented, minimized, monitored and strictly controlled in accordance with national laws and internationally accepted scientific protocols. The use of genetically modified organisms is prohibited.</p> <p>Aspect d - fully addressed:</p> <p>PEOLG:</p> <p>Criterion 2.2b: 'The spillage of oil through forest management operations or the indiscriminate disposal of waste on forest land should be strictly avoided.'</p>			

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests</p> <p>Possible action 25 “Instructions for handling and storage of chemicals and waste oil should be provided and enforced. Special restrictions are to apply near water courses and other sensitive areas”.</p> <p>ITTO guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests:</p> <p>The guidelines do not refer to waste disposal but PEFC requires that certification criteria for planted tropical forests shall be compatible with PEOLG 2.2b.</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Sub-indicator 3.5.2.5 states: ‘Chemicals, containers and liquid and solid non-organic wastes including fuel and oil are disposed of in an environmentally appropriate manner.’</p>			
<p>1.2.4 The standard must seek to ensure that productivity of the forest is maintained. In order to do this the standard must include requirements for:</p> <p>a. Management planning and implementation of management activities to avoid significant negative impacts on forest productivity.</p> <p>b. Monitoring which is adequate to check compliance with all requirements, together with review and feedback into planning.</p> <p>c. Operations and operational procedures which minimise impacts on the range of forest resources and services.</p> <p>d. Adequate training of all personnel, both employees and contractors.</p> <p>e. Harvest levels that do not exceed the long-term production capacity of the</p>	<p>Fully addressed</p> <p>Aspect a - fully addressed:</p> <p>PEOLG:</p> <p>Criterion 1.1c: “Management plans or their equivalents, appropriate to the size and use of the forest area, should be elaborated and periodically updated. They should be based on legislation as well as existing land use plans, and adequately cover the forest resources.”</p> <p>PEOLG Criterion 2.1c “Forest management plans or their equivalent should specify ways and means to minimise the risk of degradation of and damages to forest ecosystems. Forest management planning should make use of those policy instruments set up to support these activities.”</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Section 3.1 details principles related to planning at forest management unit and operational levels.</p> <p>ITTO guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Section 4 ‘Planted Forest Establishment’ details</p>	2		✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
<p>forest, based on adequate inventory and growth and yield data.</p>	<p>principles related to management planning to ensure productivity.</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Criterion 2.3: "The sustainable production of timber is ensured both in quantity and quality.' Specifically Indicator 2.3.2 'The felling rotation and yield are clearly determined and respected in accordance with the principles of sustainable production".</p> <p>Aspect b - fully addressed:</p> <p>PEOLG:</p> <p>Criterion 1.1d: "Monitoring of the forest resources and evaluation of their management should be periodically performed, and their results should be fed back into the planning process."</p> <p>Criterion 2.1b requires period monitoring of the health and vitality of forests including "pests, diseases, overgrazing and overstocking, fire, and damage caused by climatic factors, air pollutants or by forest management operations".</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Section 3.5: "Monitoring and research should provide feedback about the compatibility of forest management operations with the objectives of sustainable timber production and other forest uses."</p> <p>ITTO guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Section 5.2 Forest monitoring, growth and yield protection, recommended action 60: "establish and regularly monitor a comprehensive network of permanent inventory plots for volume assessment and collection of other necessary information and data."</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Indicators 2.6.1 and 2.6.2 call for continuous monitoring of forest management activities and regular revision of the forest management document. Feedback into planning is envisaged</p>			

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>by Indicator 3.1.4: "The results of monitoring and new scientific findings or technical data are taken into account to improve forest management and harvesting practices."</p> <p>ITTO/IUCN Guidelines for the Conservation and Sustainable Use of Biodiversity in Tropical Timber Production Forests:</p> <p>The guidelines contain several references to monitoring, for example, guideline 19 monitoring on biodiversity, priority action for guideline 17 include "appropriate monitoring systems are in place that will inform management practices over time".</p> <p>Aspect c - fully addressed:</p> <p>PEOLG:</p> <p>Criterion 1.2a: "preferring techniques that minimise direct or indirect damage to forest, soil or water resources."</p> <p>Criterion 2.2b "Appropriate forest management practices such as reforestation and afforestation with tree species and provenances that are suited to the site conditions or the use of tending, harvesting and transport techniques that minimise tree and/ or soil damages should be applied."</p> <p>Criterion 3.2a: "Forest management practices should be ensured in quality with a view to maintain and improve the forest resources..."</p> <p>Criterion 3.2b: "Regeneration, tending and harvesting operations should be carried out in time, and in a way that do not reduce the productive capacity of the site, for example by avoiding damage to retained stands and trees as well as to the forest soil, and by using appropriate systems."</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Chapter 3.2 on harvesting and 3.3 on protection include possible actions to minimise environmental damage.</p> <p>ITTO guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Recommended action 66. Take particular care to manage the impact of harvesting activities by reviewing the procedures suggested for road and site protection in section 4.2.2.</p>			

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Indicator 3.2.1 'Reduced impact logging techniques are defined at the national level and implemented.'</p> <p>Indicator 3.3.2 'Adequate procedures and guidelines exist and are implemented to identify and protect, in a manner which is representative of the diversity of habitats and at a scale adapted to the subject to be preserved: endangered, rare or threatened species of fauna and flora; and other biological components of the forest of particular interest, such as reproduction sites, rare habitats and key species'.</p> <p>ITTO/IUCN Guidelines for the Conservation and Sustainable Use of Biodiversity in Tropical Timber Production Forests:</p> <p>Guideline 30: Reduced impact logging should be used in tropical production forests.</p> <p>Aspect d - fully addressed:</p> <p>PEOLG:</p> <p>Criterion 6.1e requires "Forest managers, contractors, employees and forest owners should be provided with sufficient information and encouraged to keep up to date through continuous training in relation to sustainable forest management."</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests:</p> <p>The guidelines address training at the Principle level. The provisions do not adequately address the CPET criterion. ITTO 2005 P&C do address the criterion adequately but the PEFC system does not apply those P&C. However PEFC requires that certification criteria for natural tropical forests shall be compatible with PEOLG 6.1e.</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Recommended Action 41: "Ensure that operational staff have access to all required site information and appropriate, well-maintained site preparation equipment, and that they are</p>			

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>fully trained in recommended operating procedures...Provide facilities for on-going training to continuing improvement understanding in the workforce and field practice.”</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Indicator 2.4.4: "The concessionaire develops a staff training policy."</p> <p>ITTO/IUCN Guidelines for the Conservation and Sustainable Use of Biodiversity in Tropical Timber Production Forests:</p> <p>The guidelines include, among others, training for biodiversity monitoring (priority action of guideline 29), tropical forest taxonomy and biodiversity management (priority action of guideline 30).</p> <p>Aspect e - fully addressed:</p> <p>PEOLG:</p> <p>Criterion 1.1 b "Inventory and mapping of forest resources should be established and maintained, adequate to the local and national conditions, and in correspondence with the topics described in these Guidelines."</p> <p>Criterion 1.2a: "Forest management practices should safeguard the quantity and quality of the forest resources in the medium and long term by balancing harvesting and growth rates..."</p> <p>Criterion 3.2c: "Harvesting levels of both wood and non-wood forest products should not exceed a rate that can be sustained in the long term, and optimum use should be made of the harvested forest products, with due regard to nutrient offtake." (The TP notes that the PEFC's Minimum Requirements Checklist (PEFC Council Guidelines GL2/2010) refers to PEOLG Criterion 3.3c (and to 3.3d). The TP believes these to be mistakes and that the references should be criterion 3.3c and (3.3c)).</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Principle 16 The choice of silvicultural concept should be aimed at sustained yield at minimum cost, enabling harvesting now and in the future, while respecting recognised secondary</p>			

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>objectives</p> <p>Principle 17 In order to ensure a sustained production of timber from each forest management unit, a reliable method for controlling timber yield should be adopted.</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Recommended Action 63 addresses yield regulation and harvesting schedule based on annual allowable cut.</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Criterion 2.3 demands sustainable production of timber. Yield calculation is covered in sub-indicator 2.3.2.1 "The calculation of yield and the determination of the rotation are verifiable from the forest management document' and rotation cycle in sub-indicator 2.3.2.2 'The rotation is based on the growth rates and minimum diameter of trees to be harvested, and on data obtained from the forest management inventory."</p>			
<p>1.2.5 The standard must seek to ensure that forest ecosystem health and vitality is maintained. In order to do this the standard must include requirements for:</p> <p>a. Management planning which aims to maintain or increase the health and vitality of forest ecosystems</p> <p>b. Management of natural processes, fires, pests and diseases.</p> <p>c. Adequate protection of the forest from unauthorised activities such as illegal logging, mining and encroachment.</p>	<p>Partially addressed due to aspect c being only partially addressed.</p> <p>Aspect a - fully addressed:</p> <p>PEOLG:</p> <p>Criterion 2.1a: "Forest management planning should aim to maintain and increase the health and vitality of forest ecosystems and to rehabilitate degraded forest ecosystems, whenever this is possible by silvicultural means."</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests:</p> <p>The guidelines themselves do not include explicit requirements. However PEFC requires that certification criteria for natural tropical forests shall be compatible with PEOLG 2.1a.</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests:</p> <p>The guidelines themselves do not include explicit requirements. However, the ITTO/IUCN Guidelines apply (see below).</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the</p>	1		✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests:</p> <p>The guidelines address this requirement under Principle 3 "The main ecological functions of the forest are maintained". The guidelines say nothing explicit on planning to maintain health and vitality of forest ecosystems. However, the ITTO/IUCN Guidelines apply (see below).</p> <p>ITTO/IUCN Guidelines for the Conservation and Sustainable Use of Biodiversity in Tropical Timber Production Forests:</p> <p>Covered by Principle 11 Maintaining the function of forest ecosystems, guideline 43: Ecological knowledge should be improved and applied to ensure that forest management enhances or maintains biodiversity and thus ensures forest functions such as pollination, seed dispersal and nutrient cycling. The ecological and habitat requirements of species of both commercial and conservation concern need to be understood and addressed in forest management planning'</p> <p>Aspect b - fully addressed:</p> <p>PEOLG:</p> <p>Criterion 2.1 b: "Health and vitality of forests should be periodically monitored, especially key biotic and abiotic factors that potentially affect health and vitality of forest ecosystems, such as pests, diseases, overgrazing and overstocking, fire, and damage caused by climatic factors, air pollutants or by forest management operations."</p> <p>Criterion 2.2a encourages diversity to maximise natural protection from natural processes: "Forest management practices should make best use of natural structures and processes and use preventive biological measures wherever and as far as economically feasible to maintain and enhance the health and vitality of forests."</p> <p>Criterion 2.1 c: "Forest management plans or their equivalents should specify ways and means to minimise the risk of degradation of and damages to forest ecosystems.</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests:</p>			

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>The guidelines address fire at Principle 27. The guidelines say nothing explicit about pests and diseases.</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests:</p> <p>The guidelines address biological pest management and protection against pests, diseases and climatic calamities at recommended action 23 and fire management recommended action 39.</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Addressed by sub-indicator 1.1.12.7 “Phytosanitation and quarantine procedures are in place and enforced to prevent the introduction of pests and pathogens”. However, the indicator is not included in the PEFC Council Minimum Requirements Checklist.</p> <p>ITTO/IUCN Guidelines for the Conservation and Sustainable Use of Biodiversity in Tropical Timber Production Forests:</p> <p>Guideline 46 “The fire ecology and fire susceptibility of tropical production forests should be understood and biodiversity considerations included in fire management measures”.</p> <p>Guideline 40 “Management systems that favour natural processes and native species and enhance the productivity and resilience of the planted forest should be developed”.</p> <p>Aspect c - partially addressed:</p> <p>PEOLG:</p> <p>There is no explicit requirement to protect the forest from unauthorised activities, but PEOLG Criterion 2.1c requires that ‘Forest management plans or their equivalents should specify ways and means to minimise the risk of degradation of and damages to forest ecosystems.’</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Principle 26. “Permanent production forest should be protected from activities that are incompatible with sustainable timber production, such as the encroachment by</p>			

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>shifting cultivators often associated with the opening up of the forest.”</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Principle 63: Planted forest areas must be protected from activities that are incompatible with environmental protection and sustainable timber production, such as encroachment by cultivators, illegal wood cutters, and illicit litter collectors. Local communities are often most effective in controlling access, provided that they view the planted forest as a benefit to them, and are given the authority and the means for effective access control.</p> <p>Recommended Action 71: Control public access to roads where these roads lead solely to forest working areas. Reduce pressures for forest encroachment by integrating forest management into wider rural development strategies. For example, consideration could be given to the possibility of managing special buffer zones within and beyond the border of the planted forests, to help provide for the basic needs of the local population living near the forest and prevent illicit uses and encroachments. In the buffer zone, multiple-use should have priority.</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Indicator 1.5.6: “The forestry service/administration implements mechanisms recognized by law to protect forest under management from illegal occupation and other encroachment activities.”</p> <p>The TP concludes that the PEFC’s current requirements partially address aspect c hence a score of 1 is given.</p>			
<p>1.2.6 The standard must seek to ensure that biodiversity is maintained. In order to do this the standard must include requirements for:</p> <p>a. Implementation of safeguards to protect rare, threatened and endangered species.</p>	<p>Fully addressed.</p> <p>Aspect a – Fully addressed:</p> <p>PEOLG:</p> <p>Criterion 4.1a requires forest management planning ”to maintain, conserve and enhance biodiversity on ecosystem, species and genetic level and, where appropriate, diversity at landscape level.“</p>	2		✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
<p>b. The conservation/set-aside of key ecosystems or habitats in their natural state.</p> <p>c. The protection of features and species of outstanding or exceptional value.</p>	<p>Criterion 4.2f requires that "Infrastructure should be planned and constructed in a way that minimises damage to ecosystems, especially to rare, sensitive or representative ecosystems and genetic reserves, and that takes threatened or other key species – in particular their migration patterns – into consideration."</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Do not include explicit requirements on protection of rare, threatened and endangered species. However, ITTO/IUCN Guidelines for the conservation and sustainable use of biodiversity in tropical timber production forests include such a requirement:</p> <p>Guideline 4: Special measures will often be required when species and populations that are internationally recognized as rare, threatened or endangered occur in or adjacent to forest management areas. Appendix 1 a) states that logging is not allowed in forests set aside for plant and animal species and ecosystem preservation. PEFC's Minimum Requirements Checklist (PEFC Council Guidelines GL2/2010) cite additional PEOLG criteria for ITTO 'Natural' forests.</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests:</p> <p>There is no specific mention of the aspect; however PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 3 (section 3.1.4) mentions that for planted tropical forests in addition to the ITTO criteria the PEOLG 4.2f and 4.2i are also relevant</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Indicator 3.3.2 states, that "Adequate procedures and guidelines exist and are implemented to identify and protect, in a manner which is representative of the diversity of habitats and at a scale adapted to the subject to be preserved:</p> <p>endangered, rare or threatened species of fauna and flora; and</p>			

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>other biological components of the forest of particular interest, such as reproduction sites, rare habitats and key species”.</p> <p>addressed by Criterion 3.3 - indicator 3.3.2, 3.3.4.</p> <p>Aspect b – Fully addressed.</p> <p>PEOLG:</p> <p>Criteria 4.1 b recognises that: "Forest management planning and terrestrial inventory and mapping of forest resources should include ecologically important forest biotopes, taking into account protected, rare, sensitive or representative forest ecosystems such as riparian areas and wetland biotopes, areas containing endemic species and habitats of threatened species, as defined in recognised reference lists, as well as endangered or protected genetic in situ resources."</p> <p>PEOLG Criterion 4.2i: "Special key biotopes in the forest such as water sources, wetlands, rocky outcrops and ravines should be protected or, where appropriate, restored when damaged by forest practices”.</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests:</p> <p>Principle 7. "The different categories of land to be kept under permanent forest are (see also Appendix 1): land to be protected; land for nature conservation; land for production of timber and other forest products; land intended to fulfill combinations of these objectives."</p> <p>Possible action 7. "To identify, survey and boundary mark the various categories of the Permanent Forest Estate, in consultation with surrounding populations, taking into account their present and future needs for agricultural land and their customary use of the forest."</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests:</p> <p>The guidelines do not include explicit requirements to set aside natural ecosystem. However the ITTO/IUCN Guidelines apply (see below).</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests:</p>			

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>Indicator 3.3.2 Adequate procedures and guidelines exist and are implemented to identify and protect, in a manner which is representative of the diversity of habitats and at a scale adapted to the subject to be preserved:</p> <p>endangered, rare or threatened species of fauna and flora; and</p> <p>other biological components of the forest of particular interest, such as reproduction sites, rare habitats and key species.</p> <p>ITTO/IUCN Guidelines for the Conservation and Sustainable Use of Biodiversity in Tropical Timber Production Forests:</p> <p>Guideline 45: "Particular sites and areas of forest and other habitats that provide important ecological functions should be identified and special measures taken to ensure their protection".</p> <p>Aspect c - fully addressed:</p> <p>PEOLG:</p> <p>PEOLG Criterion 4.1b requires the identification of areas of importance for biodiversity.</p> <p>PEOLG Criterion 4.2i: "Special key biotopes in the forest such as water sources, wetlands, rocky outcrops and ravines should be protected or, where appropriate, restored when damaged by forest practices".</p> <p>PEOLG 5.1 requires identification of areas of significance for their protective functions: "Areas that fulfil specific and recognised protective functions for society should be registered and mapped, and forest management plans or their equivalent should take full account of these areas".</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests:</p> <p>The guidelines do not include requirements to protect features and species of outstanding or exceptional value but the aspect is covered by PEOLG 4.2i.</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the Establishment and Sustainable Management of Planted Tropical Forests:</p> <p>The guidelines do not include requirements to protect features and species of outstanding or exceptional value but the aspect is covered by</p>			

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>PEOLG 4.2i.</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Principles, Criteria and Indicators for the Sustainable Forest Management of African Tropical Forests:</p> <p>The guidelines do not address the aspect but it is covered by the ITTO/IUCN Guidelines (see below).</p> <p>ITTO/IUCN Guidelines for the Conservation and Sustainable Use of Biodiversity in Tropical Timber Production Forests:</p> <p>Guideline 29: “The preparation of harvesting plans, including stock maps at the compartment level, should take into consideration the local occurrence of species or habitats of special conservation concern”.</p> <p>Priority action of Guideline 38 regarding conservation in plantations: “Take measures to protect features of high biodiversity value, especially when natural forest is to be converted to plantation forest”.</p> <p>Guideline 39: “Large-scale planted forests can provide a forest matrix within which areas of high conservation value can be protected and managed”.</p>			
<p>1.2.7 The standard must require that the legal, customary and traditional tenure and use rights of indigenous peoples and local communities related to the forest are identified, documented and respected.</p>	<p>Fully addressed</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 3 section 3.5 Other requirements for forest management criteria:</p> <p>“Criteria for forest management certification shall cover the following aspects of sustainable forest management:</p> <p>Property rights and land tenure arrangements shall be clearly defined, documented and established for the relevant forest area. Likewise, legal, customary and traditional rights related to the forest shall be clarified, recognised and respected.</p> <p>Forest management activities shall be conducted in recognition of the established framework of legal customary and traditional rights, which shall not be infringed upon without the free and informed consent of the holders of the rights including compensation where applicable”.</p> <p>PEFC Council Guidelines GL2/2010. Minimum</p>	2		✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>Requirements Checklist, Part II:</p> <p>5: Checks that the scheme requires that property rights and land tenure arrangements shall be clearly defined, documented and established for the relevant forest area</p> <p>6: Checks that the scheme requires the clarification, recognition and respect of legal, customary and traditional rights related to the forest land in compliance with chapter 3.5 of Annex 3.</p>			
<p>1.2.8 The standard must require that appropriate mechanisms are in place for resolving grievances and disputes including those relating to tenure and use rights, to forest management practices and to work conditions.</p>	<p>Partially addressed.</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 3, section 3.5: Other Requirements for forest management criteria.</p> <p>“Forest management activities shall be conducted in recognition of the established framework of legal, customary and traditional rights ... Where the extent of the rights is not yet resolved or is in dispute there are processes for just and fair resolution. In such cases forest managers shall, in the interim, provide meaningful opportunities for parties to be engaged in forest management decisions whilst respecting the processes and roles and responsibilities laid out in the policies and laws where the certification takes place”.</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 3, section 3.3:</p> <p>“The fundamental conventions of the ILO ... as amended, whether ratified or not, shall be respected in the implementation of SFM”.</p> <p>Further to this Annex 3, section 3.3 states:</p> <p>“If the country in which the scheme is operational has ratified the fundamental ILO conventions, their requirements shall be considered to be covered by the legislation. In cases where the fundamental ILO conventions are not ratified, their requirements relevant to forest management shall be covered by the certification criteria.”</p> <p>“The ILO Code of Practice on Safety and Health in Forestry Work is recognised as a helpful document, which should be considered when developing national and regional certification criteria”.</p> <p>The PEFC Council Technical Document does not refer directly to the resolution of grievances and disputes</p>	<p>1</p>		<p>✓</p>

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>related to forest management practices or work conditions. Regarding work conditions ILO Recommendation R130 1967 covers the issue but the PEFC Council Technical Document does not reference the ILO Recommendation.</p> <p>The PEFC commented to the TP that the TP should also consider the requirements of ISO/IEC 65, which deals with any complaints against a certified entity, including those related to tenure and use rights, to forest management practices, and to work conditions:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">“7.1 Appeals, complaints and disputes brought before the certification body by suppliers or other parties shall be subject to the procedures of the certification body.”</p> <p>Chapter 15: “The certification body shall require the supplier of certified products to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - keep a record of all complaints known to the supplier,... - take appropriate action with respect to such complaints and any deficiencies found in products or services that affect compliance with the requirements of certification. - Documents the actions taken.” <p>The TP takes note of the requirements of ISO/IEC 65 cited by the PEFC but considers that explicit requirements should be stated in the PEFC’s standards in order fully to address the criterion.</p> <p>On the basis of the above evidence the TP awards a score of 1.</p>			
<p>1.2.9 The standard must ensure that the basic labour rights of forest workers are safeguarded. In order to do this the standard must include requirements concerning the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - freedom of association and the effective recognition of the right to collective bargaining; - the elimination of all forms of compulsory or forced labour; - the effective abolition of child labour; - the elimination of discrimination in respect 	<p>Fully addressed.</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 3, Section 3.3 International Labour organisation (ILO) Conventions: “The fundamental conventions of the ILO (outlined below) as amended, whether ratified or not, shall be respected in the implementation of SFM.</p> <p>The fundamental ILO conventions are as follows:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">No. 29: Forced Labour, 1930</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">No. 87: Freedom of associations and protection of rights to organise, 1948</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">No. 98: Right to organise and collective bargaining, 1949</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">No 100: Equal remuneration, 1951</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">No 105: Abolition of Forced labour</p>	2		✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
<p>of employment and occupation.</p>	<p>No 111: Discrimination (Employment and Occupation), 1958</p> <p>No 138: Minimum age for admission to employment, 1973</p> <p>No 182: Worst forms of child labour</p> <p>If the country in which the scheme is operational has ratified the fundamental ILO conventions, their requirements shall be considered to be covered by the legislation. In cases where the fundamental ILO conventions are not ratified, their requirements relevant to forest management shall be covered by the certification criteria.</p> <p>PEFC Council Guidelines GL2/2010. Minimum Requirements Checklist part II:</p> <p>Item 11: Checks that the fundamental ILO conventions are ratified by the country ...</p> <p>Item 12: Checks that national certification criteria address the core elements of those Fundamental ILO Conventions, which have been not ratified by the country</p>			
<p>1.2.10 The standard must require that appropriate safeguards are put in place to protect the health and safety of forest workers.</p>	<p>Fully addressed.</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document, Annex 3, Section 3.2: "National Laws and regulations, programs and policies shall be respected in forest management and certification. Certification schemes may not contradict legislation and any apparent violations of the legislation shall be taken into consideration in internal and external audits".</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document, Annex 3, Section 3.2:</p> <p>"The fundamental conventions of the ILO ... as amended, whether ratified or not, shall be respected in the implementation of SFM"</p> <p>"The ILO Code of Practice on Safety and Health in Forestry Work is recognised as a helpful document, which should be considered when developing national and regional certification criteria".</p> <p>PEFC Council Guidelines GL2/2010. Minimum Requirements Checklist part II:</p> <p>Item 13: Checks that the ILO Code of Practise on Safety and Health in Forestry Work been considered in development of national and regional certification criteria</p>	2		✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>PEOLG 6.2b: 'Working conditions should be safe, and guidance and training in safe working practice should be provided.</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Indicators 4.4.1 and 4.4.2 cover health and safety of workers</p> <p>ITTO 1992 Guidelines for the Sustainable Management of Natural Tropical Forests, and ITTO/IUCN 2009 Guidelines for the Conservation and Sustainable Use of Biodiversity in Tropical Timber Production Forests do not include specific requirements on health and safety. PEFC Technical Document Annex 3 chapter 3.1.4 states that in addition the requirements of the ITTO guidelines, the certification criteria for natural tropical forests shall be compatible with 6.2b of the PEOLG.</p>			

1.3. Standard-setting process

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
1.3.1 The standard-setting process must be consistent with the requirements of <i>ISO Guide 59: Code of Good Practice for Standardisation</i> or the <i>ISEAL Code of Good Practice for Setting Social and Environmental Standards</i> or equivalent.	<p>Fully addressed.</p> <p>PEFC requirements for the standard-setting process are set out in PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 2. Section 2 states that the document "covers standard setting procedures for certification of sustainable forest management and chain of custody certification. The procedures are based on requirements of ISO Guide 59".</p> <p>Consistency was confirmed by assessing PEFC requirements against Annex 1 of the CPET Criteria.</p>	2		✓
1.3.2 The standard-setting process must seek to ensure balanced representation and input from the economic, environmental and social interest categories.	<p>Fully addressed.</p> <p>A. Standard setting by PEFC national initiatives</p> <p>Regarding forest certification standards PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 2 section 3.4.1 Forum for standard setting states:</p> <p>"The process of development of certification criteria shall be initiated by national forest owners' organisations or national forestry sector organisations having the support of major forest owners' organisations in that country. All relevant interested parties will be invited to participate in this process. Their views will be documented and considered in an open and transparent way.</p> <p>"A Forum (e.g. committee, council, working group) shall be created to which interested parties are invited to participate in the process.</p>	2		✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>The invited parties should represent the different aspects of sustainable forest management and include, e.g. forest owners, forest industry, environmental and social non-governmental organisations, trade unions, retailers and other relevant organisations at national or sub-national level.”</p> <p>Regarding chain of custody certification standards, PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 2 section 4.2.1 states: “The chain of custody requirements may be elaborated by the forum developing the forest certification criteria or by another group established especially for this purpose. All relevant interested parties shall be invited to participate in the process. The views shall be documented and considered in an open and transparent way”.</p> <p>B. Setting the PEFC’s standards for national standards</p> <p>The PEFC’s standards for the process of setting national standards are set out in Annex 2 to the PEFC Council Technical Document. PEFC Guide GD 1003:2009 sets out the procedures for developing and approving PEFC Council technical documents. The procedures are designed to ensure balanced representation.</p> <p>The reference documents which the PEFC uses to assess forest certification schemes for endorsement – the PEOLG and the ITTO guidelines – were developed in processes to which the range of stakeholder groups within each interest category had access.</p>			
<p>1.3.3 The standard-setting and decision-making process adopted must seek to ensure:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No single interest can dominate the process; • No decision can be made in the absence of agreement from the majority of an interest category. 	<p>Fully addressed.</p> <p>A. Standard setting by PEFC national initiatives</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 2 section 4.2.1 Forum for standard setting states:</p> <p>”Formal approval of standards shall be based on evidence of consensus.”</p> <p>”Participation in the Forum shall be organised according to its respective consensus – building procedures which should provide for balanced representation of interest categories such as producers, buyers, consumers etc”</p> <p>The adopted definition of consensus (Annex 1) is taken from ISO Guide 2, which requires ”the absence of sustained opposition to substantial issues by any important part of the concerned interests” but need not imply unanimity.</p>	2		✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>The interpretation of requirements for consensus has been further detailed in Guideline GL5/2006, which also states “No single concerned interest shall be allowed to dominate the process”. This explicitly allows for voting, with the safeguard that “a negative vote which represents sustained opposition of any important part of the concerned interests to a substantive issue” triggers a further negotiation and dispute resolution process. Guideline GL5 does not provide definitions of “any important part of the concerned interests” or “substantive issue”.</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 7 details the process by which submitted national standards are subject to assessment by independent consultants, followed by a recommendation by the PEFC Council Board of Directors and a final decision by the PEFC General Assembly.</p> <p>A peer review of the national scheme assessment report may also be included in the approval process. PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 7, section 6.2.2 Assessment process and decision making: ‘When deemed necessary the PEFC Council Board of Directors may decide to submit the assessment report for peer review to the panel of experts for quality assurance purposes.’</p> <p>PEFC Council Guideline GL8/2008, which provides more details on the procedure for the Panel of Experts (POE), confirms (section 2) that a ‘decision of the Board of Directors of 26 October 2006 [which] made the PoE’s review of the evaluations reports mandatory.</p> <p>Relevant complaints procedures are detailed in PEFC Council Guideline GL7/2007.</p> <p>B. Setting the PEFC’s standards for national standards</p> <p>PEFC Guide GD 1003:2009 sets out the procedures for developing and approving PEFC Council technical documents. The procedures aim at decision-making by consensus.</p>			

2. Certification

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
2.1 Certification must be undertaken by a body whose organisation, systems and procedures conform to applicable ISO guidance, or	<p>Fully addressed.</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 6 section 3.1: “The certification body carrying out forest management certification or chain of custody</p>	2	✓	✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
publicly available equivalent.	<p>certification against a scheme specific chain of custody standard, shall fulfil requirements defined in:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) ISO 17021 if the certification is carried out as management system certification b) ISO Guide 65 (EN 45 011) if the certification is carried out as product certification (the term “product” is used in its widest sense and includes also processes and services) c) Other requirements for certification bodies defined by the national accreditation body.” 			
2.2 Certification is undertaken by a body which is accredited to evaluate against forest management standards.	<p>Fully addressed.</p> <p>PEFC Technical Document Annex 6 Section 5 states that “Certification bodies carrying out forest management or chain of custody certification, shall be accredited by a national accredited body so as to ensure that the credibility of the certification work and to facilitate mutual recognition.”</p> <p>”Accreditation bodies shall be a member of the International Accreditation Forum (IAF) or a member of IAF’s special recognition regional groups and implement procedures described in ISO/IEC 17011:2004 and other documents recognised by the above organisations”.</p> <p>”The certification body shall undertake forest management and/or chain of custody certification as “accredited certifications”.</p> <p>”The certification body carrying out forest management certification or chain of custody certification against a scheme specific chain of custody standard shall be accredited based on 17021 or ISO Guide 65 and the relevant forest management or chain of custody standard(s)/ scheme shall be covered by the accreditation scope.</p> <p>The certification body carrying out chain of custody certification against Annex 4 (Chain of Custody of Forest Based Products – Requirements) shall be accredited based on ISO Guide 65 (EN 45 011).</p> <p>In exceptional circumstances, the PEFC Council General Assembly can approve a time limited exemption from the above requirements based on written application from the PEFC National Governing Body. The application shall state (i) reasons for requesting exemption, (ii) description of how the credibility of the certification process will be assured including a list of measures currently undertaken to ensure the credibility.”</p>	2	✓	✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>According to information provided by PEFC “Application for exceptional circumstances can only be considered by PEFC if the requirements outlined in the Annex cannot be met for reasons beyond the control of the national certification scheme. Any procedures replacing the standard procedures must be comparable to the standard procedures to maintain the overall credibility of the PEFC system.</p> <p>“In the history of PEFC there has never been an application for the application of the "exceptional circumstances" clause.</p> <p>“When this clause was developed it was part of our due diligence process to cover such theoretical exceptional circumstances or eventualities where for example the national accreditation body of a specific country is not a member of the IAF but can nevertheless demonstrate its comprehensive compliance with ISO 17011 through other means. In any case the robustness and credibility would need to be clearly demonstrated.”</p>			
<p>2.3 The requirements for certification audits must include assessment of systems and documentation together with verification of outcomes in the forest adequate to ensure that both system and performance requirements in the standard are being met.</p>	<p>Fully addressed.</p> <p>Technical Document Annex 6 Section 4 requires certification bodies to operate in accordance with ISO 19011, which provides an adequate basis.</p> <p>Annex 6 also refers to other ISO guidance. Annex 6 Section 4: “The applied certification procedures for forest management certification or chain of custody certification against a scheme specific chain of custody standard shall fulfil requirements defined in:</p> <p>(a) ISO 17021 if the certification is carried out as a management system certification (b) ISO guide 65(EN 45011) if the certification is carried out as a product certification (the term product is used in its widest sense and includes also processes and services)”</p>	2	✓	✓
<p>2.4 The certification audit must include sufficient consultation with external stakeholders to ensure that all relevant issues are identified relating to compliance with the requirements of the standard.</p>	<p>Partially addressed.</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 6 section 4 states that “The audit evidence to determine the conformity with the forest management standard shall include relevant information from external parties (e.g. government agencies, community groups, conservations organisations etc) as appropriate.”</p> <p>This does not specifically require that stakeholder consultation must be designed to ensure the identification of all relevant issues.</p> <p>It is noted that the wording of PEFC Council Technical</p>	1		✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>Document Annex 6 section 4 requires lenient interpretation to justify a score of 1 rather than 0. It is recommended that the PEFC strengthen the wording so that compliance with the criterion, in particular “must include sufficient consultation ... to ensure that all relevant issues are identified...” is explicit.</p> <p>PEFC have commented as follows:</p> <p>“PEFC acknowledges CPET’s comments. The requirements of Annex 6 are scheduled to be revised as part of PEFC’s Standards Revision process. Revision of Annex 6 is scheduled to start in 2010/2011 and aims at specifying this requirement further to ensure that stakeholder consultation must be designed to ensure the identification of all relevant issues.”</p>			
<p>2.5 A summary of the results of the certification audit (excluding confidential information) must be publicly available to interested parties.</p>	<p>Partially addressed</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 6 section 4 states that “A summary of the certification report, including a summary of findings on the auditee’s conformity with the forest management standard, written by the certification body, shall be made available to the public by the auditee or in accordance with any applicable requirements defined by the respective forest certification scheme.”</p> <p>Annex 6 does not require that the public summary must be available on a relevant website.</p> <p>Annex 6 does not require that the summary shall be made available to any interested party on request within a defined timescale.</p> <p>PEFC has commented as follows:</p> <p>“PEFC acknowledges CPET’s comments, though it notes that the specification for publication on a website is part of the guidance, not the criterion.</p> <p>The requirements of Annex 6 are scheduled to be revised as part of PEFC’s Standards Revision process. Revision of Annex 6 is scheduled to start in 2010/2011 and aims at specifying this requirement further.</p>	1		✓
<p>2.6 There is an accessible and functioning mechanism for dealing with complaints and disputes which is open to any interested party.</p>	<p>Fully addressed.</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 3 section 6 on appeals, complaints and dispute procedures:</p> <p>Section 6.1 In the implementation arrangements: “The PEFC National Governing Bodies shall establish and have documented procedures for an independent dispute settlement body, either permanent or ad hoc, that takes care of those complaints arising from forest</p>	2	✓	✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>management or chain of custody scheme implementation that cannot be addressed in the dispute settlement procedures of the relevant certification or accreditation body.”</p> <p>Section 6.2 In the certification audits and decisions: “Accredited certification bodies have procedures for dispute settlement. All grievances between an applicant and a certification body on the audits, issuance, suspension, withdrawal or denial of a certificate will be handled through these procedures that are applied in each kind of certification carried out by a certification body.</p> <p>The relevant accreditation body, whose accreditation covers the certification, deals with disputes and complaints concerning observance of the accreditation requirements.”</p> <p>PEFC Council procedures for the investigation and resolution of complaints and appeals section 4.5 “Complaints submitted regarding a specific certified entity shall be referred to the relevant certification body’s own complaints / appeals resolution procedure.”</p>			
<p>2.7 The certification scheme must include measures which limit and clearly describe and justify the circumstances in which certification may be awarded to a forest, the character of which has been subject to planned and systematic transformation in a concentrated period of time with the consequence of significantly reducing the forest’s biodiversity and/or health and vitality of the forest ecosystem; for example, the conversion of natural forest or forest with many of the characteristics of natural forest to industrial forest plantation.</p>	<p>Partially addressed</p> <p>A. First certification of a forest that has already been transformed:</p> <p>ITTO Guidelines for the establishment and sustainable management of planted tropical forests (1993):</p> <p>Principle 12: “Natural Forest should not be cleared for the establishment of planted forests unless this is proved to be essential to justify retaining the land under forest cover.</p> <p>The feasibility, desirability and necessity of replacing existing natural or secondary forest by planted forest should be expertly assessed in a manner which ensures independence of judgement. This assessment should include the full range of ecological, environmental, economic and social implications and their long term consequences. The advantages and disadvantages of natural forest regrowth, enriched natural regrowth and planted forest respectively, should always be comprehensively compared before forest allocation and management decisions are taken. These issues should also be subject to wide community consultation and decisions to ensure that forest management decisions meet community needs</p>	1		✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>and are socially acceptable – key prerequisites for sustainable forest establishment and management.”</p> <p>Principle 13: Notwithstanding the provisions of Principle 12, where natural forest areas have been so severely degraded by past land use practices that their effective recovery and survival as forest is in doubt, consideration should be given to conversion of suitable sections of these highly degraded areas to more productive planted forests”</p> <p>In cases where careful assessment has proved that conversion of severely degraded natural or secondary forests to planted forests is justified, fully considering environmental, economic and social factors, such highly degraded areas may be transformed to forests or to suitable forms of agroforestry systems with improved and sustainably high levels of productivity. This would contribute to the overall forest and agricultural productivity and thereby can reduce pressure on remaining natural forests. The overall benefits the community and the nation gains from the forest estate would thereby increase in the long run.</p> <p>The TP was not able to find equivalent specific restrictions for non-tropical forest. However, there are generic requirements under the PEOLG seeking to enhance the health and vitality of the ecosystem and not to convert forests into industrial forest plantations,</p> <p>PEOLG 2.1a:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">"Forest management planning should aim to maintain and increase the health and vitality of forest ecosystems and to rehabilitate degraded forest ecosystems, whenever this is possible by silvicultural means",</p> <p>PEOLG 2.2a:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">"...Adequate genetic, species and structural diversity should be encouraged and/or maintained to enhance stability, vitality and resistance capacity of the forests to adverse environmental factors and strengthen natural regulation mechanisms".</p> <p>B. Regarding conversion of certified forest:</p> <p>PEOLG 2.2 a: "Forest management practices should make best use of natural structures and processes</p>			

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>and use preventative biological measures wherever and as far as economically feasible to maintain and enhance the health and vitality of forests”.</p> <p>ITTO guidelines for the sustainable management of Natural Tropical Forests (1992) Principle 8: “Land destined for conversion to other uses (agriculture, mines, etc.) and any land for which the final use is uncertain, should be kept under managed forest until the need for clearing arises”</p> <p>The principles from the ITTO Guidelines for the establishment and sustainable management of planted tropical forests (1993) presented under A above are relevant to conversion of certified forest.</p> <p>ATO/ITTO Indicator 3.2.2: “The conversion of forest to plantations or to non forest forms of land use is not encouraged except in circumstances where the conversion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Is related to a seriously degraded area/zone or a tiny part of the FMU; Does not take place in areas of the forest with high conservation value; and Will ensure a clearly defined, substantial and additional conservation benefit to the FMU in the long term” <p>ITTO/IUCN guidelines for the conservation and sustainable use of biodiversity in tropical timber production forests (2009), Guideline 38: “Planted forest establishment should focus on previously deforested or other degraded sites and not replace natural forest habitats of conservation concern”.</p> <p><i>N.B: As noted under Criterion 1.2.1, PEFC Technical Document Annex 3 chapter 3.1.4 states that “For the purposes of the PEFC assessment and endorsement process, the provisions of the ITTO guidelines shall be interpreted as normative and obligatory.”</i></p>			

3. Accreditation

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
3.1 Accreditation must be undertaken by a national or international body whose organisation, systems and procedures are consistent with ISO 17011:2004 <i>Conformity assessment -- General</i>	<p>Fully addressed</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 6 section 5 states that “Accreditation bodies shall be a member of the International Accreditation Forum (IAF) or a member of IAF’s special recognition regional groups and implement procedures described in ISO/IEC 17011:2004 and other documents recognised by the</p>	2	✓	✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
<i>requirements for accreditation bodies accrediting conformity assessment bodies or equivalent.</i>	above organisations.”			

4. Chain of custody

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
4.1 Assessment of chain of custody must be undertaken by a certification body operating in accordance with ISO Guide 65 or equivalent and accredited by an accreditation body operating in accordance with ISO 17011 or equivalent.	<p>Fully addressed</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 6.</p> <p>A. Certification:</p> <p>Section 3.1 states that "The certification body carrying out chain of custody certification against Annex 4 (Chain of Custody of Forest Based Products – Requirements) shall fulfil requirements defined in ISO Guide 65 (EN 45011)."</p> <p>B. Accreditation:</p> <p>Section 5 states that "Certification bodies carrying out forest management or chain of custody certification, shall be accredited by a national accreditation body so as to ensure the credibility of the certification work and to facilitate mutual recognition.</p> <p>"Accreditation bodies shall be a member of the International Accreditation Forum (IAF) or a member of IAF's special recognition regional groups and implement procedures described in ISO/IEC 17011:2004 and other documents recognised by the above organisations"</p>	2	✓	✓
4.2 There must be a certified chain of custody in place from the forest of origin to the final certified product which provides a link between the certified material in the product or product line and certified forests.	<p>Fully addressed</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 4 sets out the requirements and approaches for chain of custody throughout the supply chain: "This standard specifies requirements for chain of custody which the organisation must meet if its declarations and/ or labels referring to the origin of raw material used in the products sold/ transferred is to be recognised as credible and reliable." (Section 1.1 Scope)</p> <p>The standard specifies two approaches for chain of custody, namely physical separation and percentage-based methods:</p> <p>Section 2.1.1 "The organisation applying the physical separation method shall ensure that the certified raw material is separated or clearly identifiable at all stages of the production or trading process."</p>	2	✓	✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>Section 3.1.1 "The percentage based method of the chain of custody applies to organisations, which production/ trading processes certified raw material is mixed together with other raw material categories and the certified raw material cannot be clearly identified in the output products"</p>			
<p>4.3 If mixing of certified and uncertified material in a product or product line is allowed, the uncertified material must be covered by a verifiable system which is designed to ensure that it is from legal sources.</p>	<p>Fully addressed</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 4 section 3.6 Controversial sources:</p> <p>3.6.1 "The organisation shall establish adequate measures to ensure that the certified products do not include raw material from controversial sources".</p> <p>3.6.2 "The organisation shall require from all suppliers of the forest based raw material, which is not classified as certified raw material, at least a signed self-declaration that the supplied raw material does not originate from a controversial source. The organisation, which has signed contracts with its suppliers, shall include such a declaration in the contracts".</p> <p>3.6.3 "The organisation shall evaluate the potential risk of procuring raw material from controversial sources and establish a sampling based programme of second or third party verification of the suppliers self-declarations if a high risk exists that raw material originates from controversial sources."</p> <p>Controversial sources are defined as 'illegal or unauthorised harvesting' (section 1.3 definitions)</p> <p>Appendix 7 to Annex 4 provides requirements for the avoidance of raw materials from controversial sources outlined in section 3.6.2. These include requirements for supplier's self-declaration, risk assessment which specifies second or third party verification for high risk sources.</p> <p>According to the PEFC logo usage rules (section 7.2.3), PEFC certified logo requires a minimum 70% of raw materials from PEFC certified sources, while PEFC certified and recycled logo require minimum content of PEFC certified and PEFC recycled material to be 70%.</p>	2	✓	
<p>4.4 If mixing of certified and uncertified material in a product or product line is allowed and the proportion of</p>	<p>Partially addressed.</p> <p>According to the PEFC logo usage rules (section 7.2.3) <u>PEFC certified logo</u> requires a minimum 70% of raw materials from PEFC certified sources. Thus</p>	1		✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
uncertified material can exceed 30%, then the uncertified material must be covered by a verifiable system which ensures that it is from sustainable forest sources where the requirements for sustainability set out in criteria 1.2.3 – 1.2.6 above are being met.	<p>uncertified material may not exceed 30%.</p> <p><u>PEFC certified and recycled logo</u> requires the minimum content of PEFC certified and recycled material to be 70%.</p> <p>The amount of post-consumer recycled material is specified within the recycling symbol.</p> <p>The rules allow recycled and non PEFC (but controlled sources) material to exceed 30%. For recycled material there is no “verifiable system which provides assurance that the uncertified material (i.e. for PEFC the recycled material) is from a sustainable source” as requested by the CPET criterion. Since PEFC only breaches this criterion for recycled material and not uncertified “fresh” timber the TP considers score of 1 to be appropriate.</p>			
4.5 There is a clearly defined mechanism for controlling all claims made about the certified nature of products which ensures that claims are clear and accurate and that action is taken to prevent any false or misleading claims.	<p>Fully addressed</p> <p>PEFC ST 2001:2008 PEFC Logo usage rules – requirements (which replaces PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 5) governs claims. The document:</p> <p>lays down requirements for users of the PEFC logo to ensure accurate and verifiable, relevant and non misleading usage of the PEFC logo and related claims;</p> <p>defines the legal protection of the PEFC logo; rights to use the PEFC logo; logo usage categories and the requirements for on- and off – product usage of the PEFC logo.</p>	2	✓	✓
<p>4.6 If recycled material is used there must be a verifiable system in place which is designed to ensure that recycled material is from the following categories:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pre-consumer recycled wood and wood fibre or industrial by-products but excluding sawmill co-products unless certified • Post-consumer recycled wood and wood fibre • Drift wood 	<p>Fully addressed</p> <p>PEFC Council Technical Document Annex 4 sets out the requirements for chain of custody related to identification of origin: “The organisation shall identify and verify the category of the origin of all procured raw material.” (sections 2.2.1, 3.2.1).</p> <p>Appendix 6 to Annex 4 states that “The definition of the origin defined by this Appendix shall be used together with the requirements of this standard when organisation establishes a chain of custody to use the PEFC logo and/ or declarations covering recycled raw material.”</p> <p>Section 3 Declarations on recycled raw material (PEFC recycled raw material):</p> <p>Section 3.1 Certified raw material, (i) Post-consumer wood raw material and fibres procured directly from recycling facilities or collection centre</p>	2	✓	✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>Section 3.2 Neutral raw material. 'Non wood based raw material (e.g. agricultural fibre and rags), starch, pigments and wood harvested from housing areas (urban wood).</p> <p>Annex 4 - 1.3.13 defines post-consumer wood and fibres as not including sawmill or forestry residues.</p>			

5. National Level Application

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
<p>International certification programmes that endorse national/sub-national schemes or standards must be implementing documented systems that ensure the fulfilment, within a reasonable and practicable timeframe, of all requirements which are applicable at a national level related to:</p> <p>a. Forest standards; b. Certification; c. Accreditation; d. Chain of custody.</p>	<p>Fully addressed</p> <p>Under the PEFC programme, requirements applicable to national schemes include all of the main elements; forest standards and standard-setting, certification, accreditation and chain of custody.</p> <p>PEFC has documented procedures for developing national schemes. Detailed requirements are included in different annexes of the PEFC Council Technical Document. Requirements for standards are included in Annex 2 Rules for Standard Setting; and Annex 3 Basis for Certification Schemes and their Implementation. Certification and accreditation procedures are contained in Annex 6. Chain of custody requirements are in Annex 4.</p> <p>Annex 7 contains the detailed relating to the endorsement process: "This document describes the endorsement and mutual recognition process and refers to the minimum requirements for standard setting and scheme documentation. Procedures for the endorsement and mutual recognition of reviewed, revised and amended schemes are also described."</p> <p>The annexes are supplemented by PEFC Council Guidelines (GL8/2008): Involvement of the panel of experts in the endorsement of national forest certification schemes: "the objectives of this guideline is to provide procedures governing the appointment and work of the Panel of Experts (PoE) within the process of the endorsement of national certification schemes"</p> <p>Section 6 describes the assessment procedures, the process and decision making which must take place to endorse a scheme.</p> <p>The PEFC provided the following additional information to the TP:</p> <p>"PEFC requires and implements revisions of</p>	2		✓

Criteria	Findings	Score	L	S
	<p>endorsed national certification system every five years (see Annex 4, Chapter 6) in line with ISO practices.</p> <p>“A specific timeframe for the incorporation of new or revised PEFC requirements is decided on a case-by-case basis by the PEFC Board and/or General Assembly at the time of document approval, due to the potential need for full multi-stakeholder standard setting processes at national level (which require at minimum two years including endorsement) and depends on the complexity and comprehensiveness of the requirements. Compliance is required in any case no later than the subsequent endorsement or re-endorsement of a national scheme.</p> <p>“There is a continuous monitoring and surveillance process implemented based on the following four elements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) National certification systems are subject to regular, five yearly revisions of all documentation endorsed by PEFC. This assessment is undertaken by an independent assessor and subject to global stakeholder participation and the Panel of Expert review. As part of the endorsement conditions, all endorsed schemes are required to submit any changes to their documentation to PEFC Council for approval prior to implementation at national level. b) Compliance of forest management locally with the endorsed national standard requirements is assessed by certification bodies through annual surveillance audits and regular certification re-assessments every five years in line with ISO. c) The quality of the work of certification bodies is assessed and surveyed annually by accreditation bodies through initial assessments and the annual surveillance. <p>The TP is not in a position to judge how effectively the above requirements are executed in practice – a random sample of dates of re-endorsement of a number of National schemes were checked and these seem to show that the re-endorsement process was being undertaken and within a reasonable timescale.</p>			